

**CITY OF WENATCHEE
LAND USE HEARING EXAMINER**

IN THE MATTER OF)	FINDINGS OF FACT,
)	CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND,
HPD-15-01)	DECISION AND
Columbia Valley Community Health)	CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

THIS MATTER having come on for hearing in front of the City of Wenatchee Hearing Examiner on January 26, 2016 the Hearing Examiner having taken evidence hereby submits the following Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, Decision and Conditions of Approval as follows:

I. FINDINGS OF FACT

1. The applicant is Columbia Valley Community Health.
2. On December 15, 2015, Columbia Valley Community Health submitted a revised application for a Hospital Planned Development (HPD) to amend the previously approved four phased HPD master plan for their Wenatchee campus (PD2014-01). The purpose of the amendment is to allow for the modification of the existing sign located at the main entry on Orondo Avenue to include an electronic reader board and will be moved to the southwest to be located fully outside of the right-of-way. The base will be extended to a total width of 8' 5" to maximize the sign copy area of 40 square feet and have a height of 8 feet from the existing surrounding grade to the top of the sign. As a result of moving the sign out of the right-of-way, the applicant is proposing to eliminate one parking space and one concrete planter box. An alternative landscape plan is being proposed to enlarge the planting area around the sign and to replace the existing tree within the planter box with lower plantings for better visibility. The applicant proposes to address the parking requirements with the construction of the parking lot area on its 501 Idaho Street property.
3. This portion of CVCH's campus contains the primary CVCH care facility which is approximately 56,369 square feet in size on an approximately 2.93 acre site. An expansion is under construction for an additional 7,127 square foot addition to this facility. The subject property is within the Residential Mixed Use (RMU) Zoning District. The subject property is identified by Chelan County Tax Parcel Number: 222010590758.
4.

Total Project Size:	Approximately 2.93 acres
Domestic Water:	City of Wenatchee
Public Sewer	City of Wenatchee
Power/Electricity:	Chelan County P.U.D.
Fire Protection:	Chelan County Fire District #1
Police Protection:	Wenatchee Police Department
5. Conditional Use Permit#10-05 was issued by the City of Wenatchee Hearing Examiner on September 8, 2010, to CVCH. The remodel of the existing facility was completed in

compliance with these provisions. PD2014-01, a 4 phased hospital planned development for the CVCH campus was issued on October 30, 2014, providing for the opportunity for expansion and further redevelopment of the CVCH campus.

6. PD2014-01 provided for the approval of a reader board sign in proximity to the Orondo Avenue entrance with the following condition: *"The applicant may locate an electronic reader board at 600 Orondo Avenue as a monument sign, not a wall sign, consistent with the provisions of 10.42.080(7)(d). The site location must be consistent with the requirements of Chapter 10.50 Signs, WCC."*
7. The proposed modifications of the existing sign located at the main entry on Orondo Avenue include an electronic reader board and will be moved to the southwest to be located fully outside of the right-of-way. The base will be extended to a total width of 8' 5" to maximize the sign copy area of 40 square feet and have a height of 8 feet from the existing surrounding grade to the top of the sign.
8. The City of Wenatchee Development Review Engineer, Donald Nelson, has submitted a report dated January 5, 2016. The report is signed by the Development Review Engineer.
9. The subject property is located within the Residential Mixed Use Land Use Designation of the Wenatchee Urban Area Plan and as conditioned is consistent with the goals and policies of the plan.
10. The site is located in the Residential Mixed Use Zoning District. Hospital Planned Developments may be authorized as a planned development in these districts.
11. Hospital Planned Development (HPD) Standards
WCC Section 10.42.010(4)(b): Hospital Planned Developments, HPD, are described as:

The HPD provides for the location of hospital medical services, health care, and ancillary uses. The purpose of the HPD is to encourage comprehensive long-term master planning, to allow flexible dimensional standards that accommodate dynamic health care facility requirements, to ensure the viability of a site for hospital/medical facilities that provide high-quality, efficient health care and services, to promote good urban design in a campus setting that is pedestrian- and transit friendly, and to establish use and design standards that are compatible with adjacent neighborhoods.

WCC 10.42.060(1) Criteria and requirements establish minimum criteria for the review of all planned developments including:

- Conformity with the Wenatchee Urban Area Comprehensive Plan and its components.
- The proposal is harmonious with the surrounding area or its potential future use.
- The proposal will be superior to or more innovative than conventional development and will provide greater public benefit than required under adopted zoning standards.

WCC 10.42.060(3) Zoning requirements establish minimum provisions which planned developments must address as well opportunities and parameters for deviations from standards of Title 10, Zoning, WCC. Additional direction is provided specifically for Hospital Planned Developments under 10.42.080, which supersedes the prior listed standards where

specifically addressed. Specific provisions are established for signage in hospital planned developments which speak to the height and area of signage and provide for the opportunity for reader board signage. The specific location of the signage is not addressed in the planned development chapter.

WCC Section 10.42.080 (7):

Signs shall meet the following standards, in addition to meeting applicable provisions of Chapter 10.50 WCC, Signs:

- (a) One monument sign, per street frontage, for each building.
- (i) Maximum Copy Area. Twenty-five square feet; provided, that land parcels with more than 100 feet of frontage on any one street may increase the maximum size of the sign located on that street frontage by one square foot for each four lineal feet of street frontage over 100 feet, to a maximum sign copy area of 40 square feet.
- (ii) Maximum Height. Monument signs shall not exceed eight feet.

Signs: WCC Section 10.50.030 Minimum regulations:

(6) In all residential and mixed use zones, signs within 25 feet from driveways, points of access, and uncontrolled intersections shall be less than three feet in height from the elevation of the public right-of-way and set back a minimum of five feet from the public right-of-way. (A controlled intersection is one that has lights in all directions controlling the flow of pedestrians and traffic.);

(7) Signs must not impede visual access to the street or pedestrian ways;

(16) Any illuminated sign in a mixed use district (RMU, OMU, CN, WMU, and MRC) shall only be illuminated during normal business hours;

(22) All freestanding and monument signs shall be landscaped at a ratio of one square foot of gross sign area to one and one-half square feet of landscaping as follows:

- (a) Landscaping shall be planted at or surrounding the base of the sign;
- (b) On monument signs, landscaping shall be located and visible from the sides and behind the face of the sign with low lying ground cover in front of the sign;
- (c) The landscaping area shall be a minimum of 36 square feet with no dimension less than six feet;
- (d) Sign landscaping may be counted toward other required landscaping, provided the landscaping meets the applicable requirements of Chapter 10.62 WCC, Landscaping and Screening.

- 12. Public notice of application for this proposal and notices of the public hearing have been provided in conformance with Wenatchee City Code, Title 13.
- 13. A Revised Determination of Non-Significance was issued by the City of Wenatchee Community and Economic Development Department on October 13, 2015 for this project.
- 14. No public comments were submitted for the proposal. Agency comments received on the proposal have been considered and addressed in the conditions of approval, where appropriate.
- 15. The applicant has provided design components for signage to address design compatibility with existing development within the Orondo Avenue corridor and adjacent residential development.

16. Comprehensive plan consistency:

The Columbia Valley Community Health facility has already been determined to be an appropriate use for the project location. The monument sign is limited in height and area by the hospital planned development standards. The use of materials in the signage matches well with the design of the CVCH facilities and facility expansions. The materials are not obtrusive and muted colors blend into the campus setting with onsite landscaping. The concrete base of the sign blends with concrete features used for surrounding street trees. The reader board signage would be positioned to provide visibility to oncoming traffic and minimize visibility to homes and business on the opposing side of Orondo Avenue. The applicant has met minimum design requirements and provided signage that is complimentary to the onsite facility and appealing along the road corridor. Engineering comments evaluated the appropriateness of the proposal with respect to vehicular and pedestrian safety.

17. Title 10.42.080(7) WCC -zoning and development standards consistency:

17.1 Proposed revisions to the sign are consistent with Hospital Planned Development standards for signage for both area and height, WCC Section 10.42.080(7). The proposed revisions are oriented to Orondo Avenue, which has approximately 30' wider right-of-way width than the adjoining streets. A landscape area with grass and street trees is maintained by CVCH within the right-of-way and adjacent to the parking lot. The location and design of proposed sign appears consistent with the criteria for planned developments with respect to design and character under 10.42.060, providing conformity with the comprehensive plan, being harmonious with the surrounding area, and providing superior or innovative proposals to standards zoning standards.

17.2 Minimum regulations under sections 10.50.030 and 10.48.180(3) WCC, regulate signage to not impede visual access, limit the hours of signage illumination, provide for landscaping in proximity to signage, and restricts the location of signage in proximity to access points and intersections. The engineering comments address the question of visual access and if the identified sign location is sufficient to protect the public's health safety and general welfare. The applicant has not requested to deviate from the standard provisions of limiting the signage illumination to the hours of operation for CVCH. The applicant is purposing to remove one of the concrete boxes and a tree in order to relocate the sign and improve visibility at the entrance of the site. An alternative landscape plan has been submitted replacing the tree with lower plantings within the box. Additional landscape area will be added around the sign. Existing landscaping and future landscaping after construction will meet onsite landscaping standards.

17.3 The applicant is purposing to remove one of the existing parking stalls in order to relocate the sign outside of the right-of-way and improve visibility for vehicles leaving the site. The elimination of the parking stall will result in 163 on-site parking spaces being provided. However, the current addition under construction requires there to be 164 on-site parking spaces upon its completion. In 2016 four parking stalls along Idaho Street will be constructed. These stalls cannot count towards the required number of off-street parking spaces, but will be of assistance during the

interim construction period. As part of the phasing for this project a parking lot will be constructed on Idaho Street which will provide 12 spaces resulting in 175 off-street parking spaces provided for the site. The applicant indicates that the Idaho Street parking lot will be completed in the spring of 2017. Staff recommended a condition of approval that the parking lot be completed and available for use by the end of 2017. Otherwise the sign will be required to be removed and the parking spaces reinstalled.

18. WCC 10.42.060(3) identifies opportunities and parameters for deviations from standards of Title 10, Zoning, WCC.
19. An open record public hearing after due legal notice was held on January 26, 2016.
20. The entire Planning Staff file was admitted into the record at the public hearing.
21. The City of Wenatchee Department of Community Development recommended approval of the requested permit, subject to the recommended conditions of approval.
22. Appearing and testifying on behalf of the applicant was Dennis Dean. Mr. Dean testified that he was an agent, authorized to appear and speak on behalf of the property owner and applicant. Mr. Dean testified that the applicant had no objection to any of the proposed Conditions of Approval. He testified that the movement of this sign and other landscaping changes will make the entrance point to the facility safer for its users and the public. On questioning from the Hearing Examiner, Mr. Dean indicated that a similar sign located in East Wenatchee has not received any complaints nor caused any traffic disruptions of which they are aware.
23. Also testifying on behalf of the applicant was Patrick Bucknum. Mr. Bucknum is the CEO of Columbia Valley Community Health. Mr. Bucknum testified as to his appreciation for the process that they have been allowed to utilize in this renovation project they had been engaged in for several years.
24. No member of the public testified at the hearing.
25. Any Conclusion of Law that is more correctly a Finding of Fact is hereby incorporated as such by this reference.

II. CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1. The City of Wenatchee Hearing Examiner has been granted the authority to render this decision pursuant to WCC, Chapter 1.09 Hearing Examiner.
2. In conformance with WCC 10.42.060(1), as conditioned the proposed reader board monument in proximity to the Orondo Avenue entrance can demonstrate conformity with the Wenatchee Urban Area Comprehensive Plan and its components; the proposal is harmonious with the surrounding area; and the proposal will be superior to or more innovative than conventional

development and will provide greater public benefit than required under adopted zoning standards.

3. As conditioned the subject application demonstrates consistency with the development standards and procedural requirements of WCC, Title 10 Zoning, Title 12 Environmental Protection and Title 13 Administration of Development Standards of WCC.
4. As conditioned, appropriate provisions have been made for the public health, safety and general welfare.
5. As conditioned, the public use and interest will be served by the approval of the Hospital Planned Development.
6. Any Finding of Fact that is more correctly a Conclusion of Law is hereby incorporated as such by this reference.

III. DECISION

Based on the above Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law, Application HPD-15-01 is hereby APPROVED subject to the following Conditions of Approval.

IV. CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

All Conditions of Approval shall apply to the applicant, and the applicant's heirs, successors in interest and assigns.

1. All conditions imposed herein shall be binding on the "Applicant," which terms shall include the owner or owners of the property, heirs, assigns and successors.
2. Installation of a reader board monument sign in the vicinity of the access for CVCH on Orondo Avenue shall proceed in substantial conformance with the plans and application materials submitted on December 15, 2015 except as amended by the conditions herein.
3. The applicant is responsible for compliance with all applicable local, state and federal rules and regulations, and must obtain all appropriate permits and approvals.
4. All existing components of the monument sign currently in place within right-of-way must be removed.
5. Condition #6 of the Hearing Examiner's decision for PD2014-01 is amended by the conditions of approval contained herein.
6. The reader board sign shall only be illuminated during normal business hours.
7. A sign permit application must be submitted for review and approval prior to the placement of the reader board monument sign.

8. Onsite signage must maintain compliance with Section 10.50.030(22) WCC, for sign landscaping.
9. The proposed parking lot at 501 Idaho Street shall be completed and available for use no later than December 31, 2017. Failure to complete the parking area by this time will result in the approval for the sign being withdrawn, and the sign would be required to be removed and the parking space reinstalled by the applicant.

Dated this 28th day of January, 2016.

CITY OF WENATCHEE HEARING EXAMINER



Andrew L. Kottkamp

Action of the Hearing Examiner is final unless, within twenty one (21) days of the issuance of the Notice of Final Decision, an appeal is filed in the Chelan County Superior Court as provided for in the Wenatchee City Code, Title 13, Chapter 13.11, and RCW 36.70C.040(3)(4)(a), provided, a request for reconsideration must be timely filed prior to any appeal.